

JOINT HEALTH OVERVIEW AND SCRUTINY COMMITTEE (YORKSHIRE & THE HUMBER)

MONDAY, 3RD DECEMBER, 2012

PRESENT: Councillor J Illingworth in the Chair

Councillors S Ali, J Clark, C Funnell,
R Goldthorpe, B Hall, T Revill, B Rhodes
and L Smaje

68 Chair's Opening Remarks

The Chair welcomed all in attendance to the Joint Health Overview and Scrutiny Committee (Yorkshire and the Humber) meeting.

69 Late Items

In accordance with his powers under Section 100B(4)(b) of the Local Government Act 1972, the Chair agreed to accept the following late information:

- Additional documents relating to the Safe and Sustainable chronology and website document register (Minute No. 75 refers)
- The Transport Impact of Proposed Models of Paediatric Cardiac Centralisation in North-East England – replacement Appendix A (Minute No. 76 refers)
- Update on Judicial Review Proceedings (Minute No. 74 refers)

The documents were not available at the time of agenda despatch, but were subsequently made available on the Council's website.

70 Declarations of Interest

There were no declarations of disclosable pecuniary interests.

71 Apologies for Absence and Notification of Substitutes

Apologies for absence were submitted by Councillors J Bromby, P Elliott, M Gibbons, M Rooney and J Worton.

72 Minutes - 16 November 2012

Minutes from the meeting held on 16 November 2012 were agreed.

During discussion of the above item, Cllr T Revill joined the meeting at 10:15am.

73 Review of Children's Congenital Heart Services in England: Analysis of National Specialised Commissioning Spend (2004/05 - 2011/12)

The Head of Scrutiny and Member Development submitted a report which presented analysis of national specialised commissioning spend for the period 2004/05 – 2011/12.

The following information was appended to the report:

- A summary of the approach adopted for the analysis – including data sources and methodology, together with summary tables presenting the key findings.
- Spending analysis by Strategic Health Authority (SHA).
- Spending analysis by Government Office Region (GOR).

Simon Foy – Head of Intelligence and Performance (Leeds City Council) was in attendance to assist the Joint Committee's consideration of the information presented.

The key areas of discussion included:

- Concern regarding the apparent trend in spending on NHS National Commissioned Services.
- Queries regarding any potential correlation between historical spending levels and the outcome of the Safe and Sustainable Review – particularly in terms of the impact of nationally commissioned services.
- Analysis of spending by geography and 'time series' was not an unreasonable approach/ methodology to adopt.

RESOLVED –

- (a) That the contents of the report and appendices be noted.
- (b) That the information presented and concerns of the Joint Committee be submitted to the Secretary of State for Health and the Independent Reconfiguration panel (IRP).

74 Review of Children's Congenital Heart Services in England: Membership and Attendance Analysis

The Head of Scrutiny and Member Development submitted a report which presented an update on judicial review proceedings. The Principal Scrutiny Adviser provided a brief introduction.

Sharon Cheng – Company Secretary (Save Our Surgery Ltd.) and Lois Brown – Company Director (Save Our Surgery Ltd.) were in attendance to update members of the JHOSC. A document providing a brief update was circulated.

The key areas of discussion included:

- Save Our Surgery Ltd. was seeking a Protective Cost Order (PCO) in its action against the Joint Committee of Primary Care Trusts (JCPCT).

In the event of the PCO application being unsuccessful, it was likely that the proposed action would not proceed due to the potentially prohibitive financial risks.

- Fundraising activities continued in an attempt to finance the proposed action/ judicial review.
- A number of significant pledges had been received, including some from a number of local authorities across Yorkshire and the Humber.
- It was anticipated that the court hearing would take place in early/ mid February 2013.
- A range of additional information was being actively sought by the Chair of the JHOSC through Freedom of Information (Fol) requests.

RESOLVED – That the update and information presented be noted.

75 Review of Children's Congenital Heart Services in England: Transport Impact of Proposed Models of Paediatric Cardiac Centralisation in North East England

The Head of Scrutiny and Member Development submitted a report which provided information associated with the membership/ attendance at meetings of the Joint Committee of Primary Care Trusts (JCPCT) and various other bodies with some involvement in the Review of Children's Congenital Heart Services in England. The bodies considered included:

- Joint Committee of Primary Care Trusts (JCPCT)
- Joint Committee of Primary Care Trusts Steering Group (Steering)
- Clinical Standards Working Group (Standards)
- National Commissioning Group (NCG)
- National Specialised Commissioning Group (NSCG)
- Advisory Group for National Specialised Services (AGNSS)
- Independent Expert Panel Chaired by Professor Sir Ian Kennedy (Kennedy Panel)
- Health Impact Assessment Steering Group (HIA SG)
- National Specialised Commissioning Team (NSCT)

Neil Hunter – Head of Audit (Leeds City Council) and Brenda McLaughlin – Internal Audit (Leeds City Council) were in attendance to assist the Joint Committee's consideration of the information presented.

The Head of Audit confirmed that the Internal Audit team had undertaken an independent analysis of the information/ data presented.

The Chair suggested that an analysis of local authority decision-making may provide a similar picture to that detailed in Appendix 1 on the report. However, local council meetings tended to be held in public, with published agendas, reports and minutes – supported by declarations of interest for those taking part.

There was some concern that the review of children's congenital cardiac services in England, and the associated decision-making and advisory board processes, seemed not to be in line with what might be reasonably expected by such publically funded bodies/ organisations.

RESOLVED –

- (a) That the contents of the report and appendices be noted.
- (b) That the information presented and concerns of the Joint Committee be submitted to the Secretary of State for Health and the Independent Reconfiguration panel (IRP).

76 Review of Children's Congenital Heart Services in England: Update on Judicial Review Proceedings

The Head of Scrutiny and Member Development submitted a report that introduced a paper prepared by the Lead Clinician of the North East and West Yorkshire Paediatric Critical Care Network. This presented a Transport Impact of Proposed Models of Paediatric Cardiac Centralisation in North-East England.

A revised Appendix A was submitted to the meeting.

Dr Mark Darowski – Consultant Paediatric Intensivist (Leeds Teaching Hospitals NHS Trust) was in attendance to assist the Joint Committee's consideration of the information presented.

Dr Darowski outlined the methodology and key findings of the analysis presented to the Joint Committee, which sought to quantify time critical transfers and the economic burden on families.

The key areas of discussion included:

- The Safe and Sustainable proposed 3-hour transport threshold (4-hours for remote areas).
- No 'ideal' transport times greater than zero – i.e. immediate treatment.
- The greater the distance travelled (i.e. distance from a designated centre), risks to children would increase.
- Some conditions will require immediate surgery.

RESOLVED –

- (a) That the contents of the report and appendices be noted.
- (b) That the information presented and concerns of the Joint Committee be submitted to the Secretary of State for Health and the Independent Reconfiguration panel (IRP).

The Chair thanked all those present for their attendance and contribution to the meeting. The meeting was closed at 12:15pm